Central Bank Digital Currencies and International Payments

Alistair Milne
Loughborough University

3rd Feb, 2023,
CEMLA, Mexico City
Today’s Agenda

The outcome of an interview study with payments practitioners
I will discuss the following:
1. CBDC and International Payments: What are we talking about?
2. Research design
3. Findings in detail

(If time, broader reflections on digital assets)

Long paper 84 pages, other material (as of early 2022):
  • review of policy initiatives to improve cross-border payments
  • review of various CBDC initiatives
  • an overview of innovation, network effects and adoption
Supporting papers

Agenda items 1-3


And on agenda item 4. related papers

- *The Nexus international payments platform: is it business model viable?* (He, Milne and Zachariadis 2022), Journal of Payment Systems and Strategy, Oct
- *The law and regulation of digital assets*: (Milne 2023) in draft
1. What are we talking about?
International payments do not exist

Figure 2 of He, Milne and Zachariadis (2022)

Key point – in international payments money is not transferred; based on credit
Implications

Is CBDC in international payments about
• Supporting evolution of these existing arrangements
OR
is it about
• Transformative evolution of these arrangements to direct exchange of central bank money with no need for subsequent settlement
Note our definition of CBDC

• We employ the widest possible definition: any new form of direct access to central bank balance sheet
  • Retail: end customer
    User perspective - not easily distinguished from bank money
  • Wholesale: financial institutions, maybe large corporates

• Technology agnostic
  We do not assume distributed ledger technologies or any particular systems architecture (e.g. hybrid v. direct)

• Implication – CBDC not “one thing”
  a central bank might develop 0, 1, 2 or even more CBDCs …
2. Research design
Research methods/ Research questions

20 interviews with payments professionals

Each interview lasted at least 45 minutes, often longer

These were then transcribed and the transcription sent to the interviewees to add comments/ correct our summary. Around 100 pages in total.

Our research questions
1. How do existing cross-border payments work?
2. Can CBDC help in cross-border payment? How?
   Via evolution of existing arrangements or transformation?
# Background of those interviewed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category (by main professional experience)</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>International banks</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International card schemes</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-bank payment service providers</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regulators and infrastructure providers</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payment technology consultants</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>20</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Questions covered: four international payment scenarios

1. **Small business payments**
2. **Larger corporate transactions**
3. **International retail purchases**
4. **Remittances**

+ the possibility of transformative change
3. Findings
Figure 2 of He, Milne and Zachariadis (2022)

Key point – in international payments, money is not transferred; based on credit.
# Potential impacts: overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scenario</th>
<th>Evolutionary change: Wholesale CBDC</th>
<th>Evolutionary change: Retail CBDC</th>
<th>Transformative change - replacing Fig 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Small business</td>
<td>Reducing barriers to competition</td>
<td>Indirect: standards and identities</td>
<td>(not in paper) may help micro SMEs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Remittances</td>
<td></td>
<td>As e-money may help cashing out</td>
<td>Direct exchange of retail CBDC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large Corporate</td>
<td>Better liquidity management</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Reducing barriers to competition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International retail</td>
<td>Reducing barriers to competition</td>
<td>May be useful to tourists</td>
<td>Direct exchange of retail CBDC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. **Small business payments**

- Existing arrangements bank to bank via SWIFT messaging; increasingly non-bank alternative foreign exchange as well
- Delays, costs and lack of transparency have been a major concern
- Wholesale CBDC offers the possibility to tackle high costs and poor service quality *through greater market competition in correspondent banking service provision.*
- Benefits of Retail CBDC not so obvious.
  But could help in encouraging associated innovation e.g. adoption of global identity standards. These could lower the costs of compliance and reduce the delays that arise when there are mistakes in payment instructions
2. Remittances

- The ‘poster child’ for claims about low cost CBDC
  
  *Crypto esp Bitcoin does support low cost remittance in some contexts!*

- Issues
  - Slow speed
  - High costs – especially for “cashing out”
    - Especially for cashing out
    - And compliance with AML and sanctions
  - Issues being addressed, especially through the range of new providers

- Retail CBDC
  - Broad adoption, as an e-money, will reduce costs of “cashing out”

- Wholesale CBDC
  - Can again help new providers compete
3. Larger corporate transactions

- Customers with regular payments of $100,000 or more.
  Prompted much less discussion
- The principal challenge is not so much international payments as international liquidity management.
  They hold many currencies, effectively internalising the role of Large bank in Figure 2
- Costs, speed and transparency, not really a concern.
- Possibly, the holding of wholesale CBDC could be of interest to some of these large businesses
  especially if this eases their ability to lend and borrow in wholesale money markets.
4. International retail purchases

- the world of card payments, Visa, Mastercard etc.
  - International tourists/travellers or cross border retail purchases
  - A more complicated version of Figure 2!
- Issues
  - Speed of payment not an issue
  - Transparency matters occasionally
    - e.g. if there is a dispute or suspected fraud
  - Large costs but only the foreign exchange costs visible to the payee
    - Alternative forex providers are beginning to offer lower cost services
- Retail CBDC
  - May help with lack of acceptance at POS, if available to tourists
    - Example – eCNY during the 2022 winter olympics
  - More broadly potential concerns with market power of card associations (but this is not a specifically cross-border issue)
- Wholesale CBDC
  - May facilitate business models of alternative forex providers
5. Transformative change?

• Only with change to the architecture of Figure 2
• We discuss two possibilities
  1. Wholesale CBDC – held by financial institutions worldwide & directly exchanged
     • Allowing 24/7 cross currency liquidity management
     • Near real-time settlement
     Note that currently little demand – the CLS-now service has not taken off
  2. Retail CBDC – held directly or indirectly by natural and legal persons worldwide & directly exchanged
     • With financial institutions acting as brokers
     • Illustrated on next slide
Future reality?

Figure 3 of He, Milne and Zachariadis (2022)

But (i) many variations possible (ii) major change in business models (iii) a key issue is adoption
4. Further reflections
The “Cypherphunks” (dreamers)

John Gilmore, Eric Hughes and Timothy C. May
The role of DLT

1. DLT = Shared database, no single controller, immutable records
2. Either *permissionless* (the cryptophunk dream, must use blockchain)
3. Or *permissioned* (practical reality, completely different) closer to conventional database in most use cases (e.g. CBDC) DLT v. conventionally managed database is a secondary issue
Widespread terminological confusion ...

- Useful terms
  - Notes & coin (one definition of currency)
  - Fractionally v. fully reserved money
  - Single v. multiple record systems
  - Promise to pay v. directly held money
  - Automatically executed contracts
  - Payment schemes (and their supporting information exchange)

- Unhelpful terms (confused or poorly understood)
  - Digital assets (I have a lot more on this)
  - Virtual currency
  - Digital currency
  - Token money
  - Atomic settlement
  - Smart contracts
  - Legal tender

If you cannot express your self without these terms, you have not understood what you are saying.
G20 Roadmap for Enhancing Cross-border Payments – first consolidated progress report Oct 2021

*Focus area A: Committing to a joint public and private sector vision to enhance cross-border payments*

The vision is regulatory reporting! (very much a regulator’s vision 😊)

- We have not even begun to discuss the architecture of cross-border payments…
  
  implications for RTGS – much less netting/ fractional reserving

- Whatever the direction of travel we must pay attention to the viability of business models (see further JPSS paper)
  - Mostly likely this means focusing on standards development not creating new platforms
Thank you!

https://www.lboro.ac.uk/departments/sbe/staff/alistair-milne/


www.alistairmilne.com